



CITY OF SOMERVILLE, MASSACHUSETTS
MAYOR'S OFFICE OF STRATEGIC PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
JOSEPH A. CURTATONE
MAYOR

MICHAEL F. GLAVIN
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

DETERMINATION OF PREFERABLY PRESERVED STAFF REPORT

Site: 12 Warwick Street

Case: HPC 2015.022

Applicant Name: Sal Querusio

Date of Application: May 22, 2015

Date of Significance: July 21, 2015

Recommendation: Preferably Preserved

Hearing Date: August 18, 2015



**A determination of Preferably Preserved begins a nine month Demolition Delay.*

I. Meeting Summary: Determination of Significance

On Tuesday, May 22, 2015, the Historic Preservation Commission, in accordance with the Demolition Review Ordinance (2003-05), made a determination that 12 Warwick Street is Significant. Per Section 2.17.B, this decision is found on the following criteria:

Section 2.17.B - The structure is at least 50 years old;

and

(i) *The structure is importantly associated with one or more historic persons or events, or with the broad architectural, cultural, political, economic or social history of the City or the Commonwealth;*

and / or

(ii) *The structure is historically or architecturally significant (in terms of period, style, method of building construction, or association with a reputed architect or builder) either by itself or in the context of a group of buildings or structures.*

According to *Criteria 2.17.B*, listed above, historic map and directory research identifies the structure as c. 1876.

In accordance with *Criteria (i)*, listed above, the Commission agreed with Staff findings, The structure was determined 'Significant' due to an association of the property with the broad architectural, cultural, economic and social history of the City due to the association of the property with workers and the



Boston Brick Company, whose location and employment opportunity prompted the development of this small neighborhood of working class housing.

In accordance with *Criteria (ii)*, listed above, the Commission agreed with Staff findings. The Commission also found the subject building historically and architecturally significant to the ability of the subject parcel to convey significance regarding location and design both individually and within a group of buildings in terms of scale, height, form and massing. This building retains a number of qualities that continue to convey both historic and architectural significance, such as the location of the structure on the lot and the spatial relationships between the subject dwelling and other dwellings along Warwick Street. Other qualities that convey significance include the original form and massing, fenestration pattern for various façades, and the side-hall interior plan, which is understood from the exterior.

The period of significance for 12 Warwick Street begins at the time of construction, c. 1876, and extends into the twentieth century as this dwelling continues to house the working class, and more particularly, laborers of the working class such as the first owner, Andrew Maloney, gardener and family, residents from 1876 to 1924, and later Nazzareno Tarabelli, carpenter and cabinetmaker, and family, residents from 1929 thru the 2012.

II. Additional Information

Additional Research:

- Clyde, Murdock and Warwick streets, known as the Patch neighborhood, developed as a small neighborhood of working class housing beginning in the mid nineteenth century. Asa Murdock, a Cambridge brickyard owner and real estate speculator, owned tracts of land in this neighborhood. Architecturally, several of the simple houses in this neighborhood are distinctive due to their high brick foundations and uniform three-bay façades, such as 13 and 25 Clyde Street. These are similar to the 1820-1850 brick workers houses of Northwest Cambridge.

The 1852 Draper map shows one house located along Clyde Street and the 1859 Walling map of Boston and Vicinity illustrates eight houses along the south side of Clyde Street. Clyde Street developed as early as 1852, while Murdock and Warwick were not developed for approximately another twenty years (1871-72).

- Oral history from Linda Marchi, previous owner, places the Tarabelli and Marchi families in the midst of a tight-knit Italian-American community centered in the Patch. Several of the families on the street had inter-married with a lot of mutual support over time.

Nazzareno Tarabelli laid floors, constructed the second floor addition, built a china cupboard; in one photograph, he is shown seated with his wife on Adirondack chairs that he built.

Site Visit:

- The house is located just one lot in from Cedar Street. Houses on both sides of Warwick Street are of similar scale but slightly different massings. A comparison between the 2014 and the 2013 Google street views show how the alteration of the neighborhood is changing. As recently as 2013, the Warwick streetscape is the only streetscape in the Patch neighborhood that remains almost fully intact. Maxwell's Green creates a street wall at the east end of the street and industrial buildings encroach on the corner of Cedar Street; however, Warwick Street still retains the original development pattern and variety of building types. Clyde Street has seen some infill and several building alterations, but remains moderately intact while Murdock Street is predominantly composed of infill buildings.



Warwick Street, north side facing east, 2014



Warwick Street, south side facing east, 2014

Comparable Structures:

There are few structures that are appropriate to compare with the subject dwelling due to the combination of the potential age of the structure, the modest 1½ story massing, and siting with regard to the side-gable. There are multiple buildings still existent from the mid-nineteenth century, though their massing is often larger. There are also a number of single-family dwellings with a modest 1½ story massing located throughout the City; however, these cottages are often more ornate in design and do not have a side-gable nor face the side lot line. The adjacent gable-end dwelling, according to maps, may have originally been similar to the subject building. Comparable structures within the City include: 37 Fiske Avenue (c. 1866), 23 Fiske Avenue (c. 1870), 93 Properzi Way (c. 1870), 282a Lowell Street (c. 1875), 45 Trull Street (c. 1880), and 80 Hinckley Street (1890).



Right: 37 Fiske Avenue (c. 1866)



Left: 23 Fiske Avenue (c. 1870)



Right: 93 Properzi Way (c. 1870)



Left: 282 Lowell Street (c.1875)



Right: 45 Trull Street (c. 1880)



Left: 80 Hinckley Street (1890)



Warwick Street, north side facing east, 2013

III. Preferably Preserved

If the Commission determines that the demolition of the significant building or structure would be detrimental to the architectural, cultural, political, economic, or social heritage of the City, such building or structure shall be considered a preferably preserved building or structure. (Ordinance 2003-05, Section 4.2.d)

A determination regarding if the demolition of the subject building is detrimental to the architectural, cultural, political, economic, or social heritage of the City should consider the following:

- a) *How does this building or structure compose or reflect features which contribute to the heritage of the City?*

The form and massing of this single-family dwelling represent an increasingly rare residential building type within the City. The Warwick streetscape and surrounding neighborhood were predominantly composed of structures similar to the form and massing of the subject parcel, and together, the buildings that form this streetscape illustrate the suburbanization of working class housing in the last quarter of the 19th century. These small single family homes with yards large enough to grow vegetables and house a cow or chickens were extremely desirable.

This building retains a number of qualities that continue to convey both historic and architectural significance, such as the location of the structure on the lot and the spatial relationships between the subject dwelling and other dwellings along Warwick Street. Other qualities that convey significance include the original form and massing, fenestration pattern for various façades, and the side-hall interior plan, which is understood from the exterior.

- b) *What is the remaining integrity of the structure? The National Park Service defines integrity as the ability of a property to convey significance.*

The Commission found that integrity of this single-family dwelling is retained within the location and form, as well as, integrity of design. The structure retains integrity of location through siting and orientation as well as through spatial relationships to other buildings along Warwick Street. The main massing component with the gable end toward the street and fenestration patterns are clear and have not been much altered over time.

- c) *What is the level (local, state, national) of significance?*

The Commission determined that this structure is Significant due to the association of the property with workers and the Boston Brick Company, whose location and employment opportunity prompted the development of this small neighborhood of working class housing and due to historical and architectural significance, predominantly with regard to location and form, within the context of a group of structures.

Working class housing constructed in response to mid-nineteenth century industry is of local significance. Working class housing represents an aspect of local history indicating the location of industries and strength of the economy on all levels of society. Dependent upon the actual age of the structure as well as construction methods, this building could represent more than local history.

- d) *What is the visibility of the structure with regard to public interest (Section 2.17.B.ii) if demolition were to occur?*

The subject parcel is the first house in what was a grouping of workers housing on both sides of Warwick Street from Cedar Street. The railroad that had once run alongside the street has been replaced with an extension of the Community Path. This right of way extends from the Cambridge line near Arlington to Lowell Street and will eventually run all the way to Boston. Neighborhoods and streets such as Warwick

- e) *What is the scarcity or frequency of this type of resource in the City?*

Dwellings from this time period are not predominant, but the City does retain several from the mid-nineteenth century. Often their massing is larger. There are also a number of single-family dwellings with a modest 1½ story massing located throughout the City; however, these cottages are often more ornate in design, of a later development period, and do not have a side-gable nor face the side lot line.

Upon a consideration of the above criteria (a-e), is the demolition of the subject building detrimental to the architectural, cultural, political, economic, or social heritage of the City?

The Commission found the subject parcel 'Significant' due to an association of the property with the broad architectural, cultural, economic and social history of the City especially the association of the property with workers and the Boston Brick Company, whose location and employment opportunity prompted the development of this small neighborhood of working class housing.

The Commission also found the subject building historically and architecturally significant to the ability of the subject parcel to convey significance regarding location and design both individually and within a group of buildings in terms of scale, height, form and massing. This building retains a number of qualities that continue to convey both historic and architectural significance, such as the location of the structure on the lot and the spatial relationships between the subject dwelling and other dwellings along Warwick Street. Other qualities that convey significance include the original form and massing, fenestration pattern for various façades, and the side-hall interior plan, which is understood from the exterior.

The period of significance for 12 Warwick Street begins at the time of construction, c. 1876, and extends into the twentieth century as this dwelling continues to house the working class, and more particularly, laborers of the working class such as the first owner, Andrew Maloney, gardener and family, residents from 1876 to 1924, and later Nazzareno Tarabelli, carpenter and cabinetmaker, and family, residents from 1929 thru the 2012.

Although the immediate historical context is changing, this building continues to fit within the broader working class historical context of the neighborhood and represents local significance. Dwellings from this time period are not predominant, but the City does retain several workers cottages from the nineteenth century, though often their massing and form is different. Therefore, Staff finds the potential demolition of 12 Warwick Street detrimental to the heritage of the City.

IV. Recommendation

Recommendations are based upon an analysis by Historic Preservation Staff of the permit application and the required findings for the Demolition Review Ordinance, which requires archival and historical research, and an assessment of historical and architectural significance, conducted prior to the public hearing for a Determination of Preferably Preserved. This report may be revised or updated with a new recommendation and/or findings based upon additional information provided to Staff or through further research.

In accordance with the Demolition Review Ordinance (2003-05), Section 4.D, Staff find the potential demolition of the subject structure detrimental to the heritage of the City, and consequently in the best interest of the public to preserve or rehabilitate. Therefore, due to the increasing rarity of this type of residential dwelling and associated streetscape within the City, and the location of the structure within the Warwick Streetscape, **Staff recommend that the Historic Preservation Commission find 12 Warwick Street Preferably Preserved.**

If the Historic Preservation Commission determines the structure is Preferably Preserved, the Building Inspector may issue a demolition permit at anytime, upon receipt of written advice from the Commission that there is no reasonable likelihood that either the owner or some other person or group is willing to purchase, preserve, rehabilitate or restore the subject building or structure (Ord. 2003-05, Section 4.5).



12 Warwick Street, aerial view